Volume 1: 2008-2009 ISSN: 2041-6776





# 'I have my tricks and trap doors too': Double Deixis, Reader Investment and Self-Identification in Literature and Popular Music.

**Andrew Straiton** 

This project is designed to be read alongside and as an extension to my earlier study, *Shifting Visions of the Self: Deixis¹ in Joking, Poetry and Song Lyrics* (2009), in which I argued that one way of understanding a receiver's relationship with a text, deictic shift theory (DST, Stockwell 2002: 46-49; McIntyre 2006: 99-121, 2007:124-129), relied too heavily on a 'fixed view of deictic projection,' (Straiton 2009: 7) and the abandonment of a text receiver's egocentric position. I suggested that the 'projection' model was unable to account for a phenomenon typically seen in the relationship between readers and shorter texts; the strong personal response commonly referred to as becoming 'immersed in the world' of a narrative (Stockwell 2002:46). I argued that receivers of such texts were encouraged, through a deliberate lack of deictic world-building elements and ambiguous personal pronoun use ('active context creation,' Semino 1992: 135; Stockwell 2002:46 and 'double deixis' Herman 1994, respectively), to actively read their own experiences onto the texts.

Andrew Straiton 29/04/09

'But above all, I will never forget who this victory truly belongs to; it belongs to you. ...This is your victory!'

Barack Obama

On the 5<sup>th</sup> November 2008, President-elect of the United States of America, Barack Obama, delivered his electoral acceptance speech, representing in my view an almost perfect exercise in the art of inspirational and transformative rhetoric. Obama's campaign repeatedly conceptualised the historical significance of the election in terms of a personal resonance in the individual American citizen's life, through such slogans as 'Yes We Can' and 'Hope: Change We Can Believe In.' As the media frenzy that surrounded his election testified to, Obama's words were endowed with an emotive power that was able to challenge and inspire the listener. Much of this power, however, was owed to the linguistic practice of repeatedly involving the individual in the corporate experience of the victory. The second person pronoun, 'You' and first person plural 'We' were used repeatedly throughout his speeches, encouraging the receiver to infer a deeply personal involvement in the groundbreaking election and to take ownership of the words he spoke. As his speech reached its close, Obama also addressed those 'from beyond our shores,' to include foreign nations within the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> I use Bühler's understanding of deixis, from the Greek meaning 'pointing or showing,' (Wales 1989: 112) to describe the idea that certain words have a shifting meaning in different contexts, '[as] the arm and finger gesture in a man...deictic words like 'here' or 'there' function in a very similar way' (Bühler 1982: 11). Hence, to fully understand such statements, a reader must be able to perform a deictic shift (Stockwell 2002: 46-49; McIntyre 2006: 99-121, 2007:124-129), interpreting the deictic markers from a perspective outside of their own.

scope of his victory; the words, 'our stories are singular, but our destiny is shared' epitomising the rhetorical expansion of his political cause. The speech undoubtedly commanded an extraordinary emotive power in the psyche of those who listened and supported his campaign, as I too, thousands of miles away from the Chicago park where Obama stood – despite playing absolutely no role in his election whatsoever - could not help being coerced into believing that, somehow, his victory also belonged to me.

This project concerns that very phenomenon - the ability for language to engage with a receiver outside of the immediate context and intention of its production. Borne out of observation and conversation, I have noted that narrative (be it printed text, moving image or spoken/sung words) is able to evoke strong emotions in individual listeners, viewers and readers (receivers) who are exposed to their content. In some cases, I argue that these texts enact such a response through implicating a reader (on a cognitive level) within the fictive frame, encouraging them to project a vision of the self that is seen to take up either an embodied or observational position within the world of the text (Brunyé et.al 2009:27).

Therefore, I intend to use this project to explore research in cognitive linguistics and psychology to further understand the manner in which a text can create and exploit an empathic and self-implicative relationship with a reader, and understand what such conclusions assert regarding the processing of narrative as part of an embodied cognitive experience. To achieve this, primarily I will consider two case texts; Alice Munro's short story 'Tell Me Yes or No,' and the pop song 'She Will Be Loved' by Maroon 5, as a vehicle to discussing textual strategies which function to develop a sense of self identification, self implication and the possibility of modification of the self through their textual form. I will stress the importance of a 'shared domain' (Green 1995: 11) in the empathic process commonly understood as 'being moved by art' (Djikic et.al 2009: 24).

However, I wish to begin by setting the technical boundaries of my analysis. Above all else, my assertions rely on recognition of the concept of 'relationship' residing at the heart of any linguistic or textual experience. Gavins (2003, 2007) uses Werth's (1999) cognitive poetic framework text world theory, to articulate the dynamics of this productive relationship, writing that readers process and understand the content of texts, by 'constructing mental representations in their minds...' (Gavins 2003: 129). This projected mental representation of the fictive realm, the text world, is seen as ontologically distinct from the preceding narrative level, the 'discourse world,' which Stockwell describes as the real world 'language event involving two participants,' (Stockwell 2002:136).

Text worlds are structured by 'world building elements' (those which deictically 'anchor' the projected world contextually) and 'function advancing elements' which 'constitute the actions, events, states and processes whose presence can be seen to propel the discourse forward' (Gavins 2003:130-131). Importantly, Gavins acknowledges the productive tension in this reader-writer relationship, noting that text world theory runs on a convergence of textual, linguistic input and the inevitable 'personal baggage' (memories, prejudices, experiences and opinions) each receiver brings with them. Hence, text-world theory views reading as a conjunction between linguistic form and the individual, and can account for the 'process of joint negotiation' (Gavins 2003: 130), which has shown to be problematic for DST (Straiton 2009: 7).

This concept of a productive relationship, the idiosyncratically constructed 'text world,' is supported by research in cognitive psychology, which asserts that modelled projection is at the centre of the reading experience (Johnson-Laird 1983). In reference to this area of research, Kelter et.al (2004) write 'it is widely agreed that narrative comprehension involves creating a mental representation of the states of affairs described by the text' (Kelter et.al 2004: 451). In development of these ideas, O'Neill and Shultis (2007) have suggested such 'projection' is not simply representational, but rather produces a dynamic situation

model – where a reader is seen to actively construct a spatial representation of a text and simultaneously take up a psychological 'vantage point' (mental states, goals and plans) of one or more characters whilst reading (O'Neill and Shultis 2007: 1032-3). These papers assert the human mind processes this linguistic input 'online,' (Kelter et.al 2004: 451) in the same way the brain processes information from the real world. As Kelter et.al suggest, 'language comprehension results in representations similar to those involved in direct experience' (Kelter et.al 2004: 461).

According to this research linked to text world theory, world-building elements are viewed as triggers for certain productive responses in the human mind, structuring the metaphysical nature of the projected fictive scene. Stockwell categorises these textual elements into several sections, 'Time (t)', 'Location (l)', and grouped together, 'Characters (c) and Objects (o)' (Stockwell 2002: 137). It is particularly the third section of Stockwell's classification that interests me the most, because if one accepts the premise that texts are processed online, in the same manner as ordinary experience, text world theory suggests that the identity of who is acting or being acted upon in a given discourse situation is of vital importance in producing a psychological 'vantage point' from which to interpret a narrative.

Therefore, each type of narrative expression (first, second and third person), encodes a distinctly different relationship with the receiver of a given text. As Herman writes, 'every novelistic technique implies a metaphysical attitude on the part of the author,' (Herman 1994: 378). Research into trauma therapy, for example has shown categorically that each narrative mode commands a different dynamic between author, text and addressee, commonly understood through the metaphor of 'emotional distance.' Seih et.al (2004) noted that highly anxious subjects, who were encouraged to develop first person diary entries into third-person narratives along a scale, experienced a reduction in anxiety. According to Seih et.al, this occurred because 'the first-person pronoun phrase promotes emotional disclosure...the second-person pronoun phase stimulates one's dialogue with oneself...[and] the third person pronoun actualizes personal emotional experience from an objective and distant position' (Seih et.al 2004:41).

This research suggests that first and second person narratives encode a 'close' emotional attachment to events described, whereas third person narrative tends to distance narrators and readers from the events, limiting the scale of personal emotional responses. Seih et.al noted the second-person diary entries, 'looked like inner dialogue among themselves and a corresponding supportive partner' (Seih et.al 2004: 39). I argue this sense of inner dialogue, or *relationship*, is the central feature of second-person narratives - the invocation and indication of a personal relationship. As Kacandes expresses, 'the second person is the pronoun of relationship...[it is] the tangible and irrepressible sign of an intersubjective relationship between an 'I' and a 'You' (Kacandes 1994: 2).

This concept of 'relationship,' as one has noted in reference to text-world theory, is not an abstract literary term, but has a strong investigative background in cognitive science. Research into the language use of infants, specifically the acquisition and use of pronouns, has shown that the second person narrative mode uniquely exploits an early stage of cognitive development. According to Dale and Crain-Thoreson (1993), 'pronoun reversal,' is a common error in early language development – 'You' and 'I' being reversed at least once by 60% of children in their study (Dane and Crain-Thoreson 1993: 573). The problem seems primarily connected to an early developmental error in relationship to the second person pronoun – where a child wrongly interprets 'You' to always refer to themselves – an 'egocentric functioning' (Dale and Crain-Thoreson 1993: 577). In explanation, the paper suggests that the pronoun reversals are typically caused by a misinterpretation of the deictic reference, and hence a failure to 'perform a deictic shift' (Dale and Crain-Thoreson 1993:1).

This ability to shift perspective is therefore seen as a landmark in cognitive development, thought to be achieved through overhearing pronouns being used in an alternative referential context (research actually suggests younger siblings are typically proficient in pronoun use earlier than the eldest child, being exposed to more 'non-addressed speech' - Oshima-Takine et.al 1999: 569). Furthermore, Ricard et.al (1999) note that this pronominal proficiency develops in line with a child's 'competence at co-ordinating two visual perspectives,' these results affirming the link 'between cognition and language' (Ricard et.al 1999: 681), and supporting the notion of dual online processing of linguistic and visual inputs mentioned above (Kelter et.al 2004). Nevertheless, the directly implicating reference that 'You' provokes must be understood in this psychological context. I argue here that the 'appellative power' of the second person pronoun, which 'subliminally extends an irresistible invitation to whoever hears it to feel addressed' (Kacandes 1994: 2) stems from this early developmental stage of childhood, where a generally egocentric<sup>2</sup> view of the world is slowly replaced by a more empathic view where perspectives and emotions of others are understood. Therefore, one argues that fiction predominating in second person address is endowed with such affective emotivity directly through an exploitation of this latent infant egocentrism, the cognitive viewpoint held in infancy.

These conclusions regarding the psychological ambiguity of 'You' can be viewed as ancillary to Herman's (1994) earlier work on the textual ambiguity of the pronoun, rooting his assertions in cognitive science. Herman identified the textual phenomenon whereby, 'You,' forms a problematic 'doubly deictic' term, being seen to address a multiplicity of entities inside and outside the context of a given language event (Herman 1994:1), without changing form. In a conventional reading experience, the pronoun causes what Herman calls 'ontological hesitation' (Herman: 1994:1), where the linguistic term is denied fixity within a certain narrative. In Herman's analysis of Edna O'Brien's *A Pagan Place* he identifies 'five functional types of deictic you' (Herman 1994:3) all of which construct very different ontological and metaphysical relationships between author, narrator, character and reader. Through application of Gavins' framework, each form of 'You' can be understood as follows.

#### 1.) 'Generalized You'

The first usage Herman identifies is perhaps the most familiar and common in spoken discourse. Sentences including generalized 'You,' are often rhetorical statements of little actual content, designed to draw out tacit agreement from the receiving partner. Consider, for example, the following from Alice Munro's *Tell Me Yes or No*,

'You know, everybody knows, the catalogue of delusions we subscribed to in the fifties...'

(Munro 1974: 107)

## 2.) 'Fictional Reference'

Herman sees this second form as pervasive in many second person texts. Referred to as 'fictional reference,' it is a textual strategy where 'the entity evoked by 'You' exists in the world of the narrative as the fictional protagonist who addresses to herself a narrative of which she in turn is the intradiegetic narratee' (Herman 1994:2). Importantly, Herman notes that this type of second-person narration causes a reader to 'construe the entity [evoked by 'You'] as being more or less virtual with respect to our world,' because in this instance the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Interestingly, research into personality disorders have shown that adults who score highly on a narcissistic scale typically used more first-person pronouns in spoken discourse than those of an average score (Raskin and Shaw 2006: 393). This suggests, as one would expect, that those of an egocentric tendency process the world in constant relation to themselves. Without wishing to appear reductive, it is possible that these particularly narcissistic individuals never reached the cognitive-empathic threshold described by Ricard et.al (1999), remaining in a quite literally 'childish' state of mind.

divide between the 'I' who performs the illocutionary act and the 'You,' to whom it is addressed are collapsed into a single entity (Herman 1994: 2-3). Herman argues that this type separates the grammatical form from the deictic function of the pronoun, by means of 'deictic transfer.' This functions to maintain the fictional alterity of the text-world, and resists implicating the reader within it, as the communicative dialogue is perceived as private communication produced by and addressed to the same narrator—protagonist.

#### 3.) 'Fictionalized/Horizontal Address'

Herman draws a distinction here between 'fictional reference' and 'fictionalised address,' which in contrast to the above instance, is formed directly from the convergence of the grammatical form and the deictic function of the pronoun. Herman describes this type as 'address to and/or by the members of some fictional world' (Herman 1994:2); 'horizontal' character accessible communication between entities on the same narrative level. It sustains a reader's alterity in relationship to the fictive text-world, affirming their position within the discourse world. Fictionalised address will often appear in a narrative as reported speech between two characters; consider the following from Munro,

```
"I didn't write these letters."

"Aren't you her?"

"No. I don't know who she is. I don't know."

"Why did you take them?"

"I didn't understand..."
```

(Munro 1974: 122)

#### 4.) 'Apostrophic/Vertical Address'

Fourthly, is the form of narrative 'You' that Herman terms as 'apostrophic address.' Herman describes this as a deictic reference which 'exceeds...the ontological threshold' of the textworld, directly engaging with the reader of the text (Herman 1994:3). This technique is rare, perhaps seen most conventionally in morally didactic fiction or religious narratives, where the authorial intention is to attempt to change the behaviour of the reader. I argue, however, that repeated use of this textual strategy actually serves to limit, rather than to intensify the scope of the emotive power of a text, by affirming the difference between the fictive frame and reality.

#### 5.) 'Doubly Deictic You'

Herman's final category, 'double deixis' is the means whereby such emotive engagement and reader investment can be cultivated, through the ambiguation of the pronominal referent. Herman suggests that this use of doubly deictic 'You' dominates the narration of O'Brien's novel and is used to a degree of near indecipherability, functioning primarily to disorientate the reader. The ambiguous usage of 'You' places the reader, 'within the emergent spatiotemporal parameters of one or more possible words...' (Herman 1994:1); or to use Gavins' framework - placed uncomfortably between the text world and the discourse world. Herman argues that manipulation of 'You,' in O'Brien's novel 'produces an ontological hesitation between the virtual and the actual' (Herman 1994: 1); a strategy that jeopardises the security of a reader's position outside of the text, simultaneously transgressing and sustaining the ontological distinction between the fictive frame and the real word. The longer such hesitation is left unresolved, the more difficult pronominal interpretation becomes; the reader being forced to repeatedly question and process who 'You' actually refers to in the context of the language event. The tension of such duality serves to intensify the verisimilitude of the fictive text-world, which in turn encourages a stronger emotive attachment from a reader towards the textual 'You.'

Alice Munro's short story *Tell Me Yes or No* can also be seen to deliberately use and exploit these ambiguous doubly deictic references, but to a markedly different effect to O'Brien's narrative. Munro's use of the pronoun produces, like O'Brien's, a deeply engaging narrative, but also functions as a self-reflexive meditation on the power of deictic reference to manipulate and structure a reader's response to a text. Munro can be seen to make allusions to the construction of perception throughout her work, one character being described as, '...not a person to remember people at the fringes' (Munro 1974: 119), such references, along with a notably inventive ending, functioning to expose the artifice of the whole fictional enterprise.

Appearing in her 1974 collection *Something I've been Meaning to Tell You*, Munro's narrative concerns an unnamed female narrator-protagonist, who describes her extra-marital relationship with an unnamed 'You' – whom it later becomes clear is a married man living in a distant city. Discovering one morning that the 'You' figure is dead, the narrator-protagonist decides to visit the city where 'You,' lived – only to find out from his (your) wife that 'You' were actually engaged romantically with a number of women. Note here that even in my description of the narrative one cannot escape the pervasiveness of the relationship that is created between 'You' and 'I', the opening lines of the short story immediately calling the reader into relationship with the narrator,

'I persistently imagine you dead.

You told me that you loved me years ago. Years ago.
And I said that I too, I was in love with you in those days.
An exaggeration.'

(Munro 1974: 106)

At this point in the story Munro has not employed any world-building or deictic structuring to inform a reader precisely to whom the text is addressed, thus these opening lines of the story are perceived to directly address the reader, in the form of apostrophic address. However, as the story moves on, the character 'You' becomes increasingly deictically anchored in the text-world – shown to be male, married, a 'graduate student' (p.108) older than the narrator, even speaking lines of dialogue in a recalled memory (p.111). Hence, as the narrative advances, the lines that a reader is encouraged to interpret as apostrophic address are shown to have actually been horizontal address between two distinct characters within the fictive world. However, such is the intensity of the apostrophic address (and its subject matter - the death of 'You,') that the two combine to form an inescapable doubly deictic reference that ties the reader to the addressee of 'You' throughout the story, no matter how much of a deictic alterity 'You' becomes. I argue that this textual strategy forces the reader to take up the psychological 'vantage point' of the addressee, encouraged from the beginning to understand the second person address in terms of an embodied presence within the narrative.

This strong embodied affinity to the narrative 'You' in *Tell Me Yes or No* is further complicated by Munro's denouement. In the final paragraph, the narrator confesses that the 'You' character is nothing more than an imaginative construct invented by the protagonist. Devastatingly, Munro writes,

'But you were the one, I keep forgetting, you were the one who said it first. How are we to understand you?

Never mind. I invented her. I invented you, as far as my purposes go. I invented loving you and I invented your death. I have my tricks and trap doors, too.'

(Munro 1974: 124)

With clinical slight of hand, the protagonist returns the 'You' figure's infidelity with a grand deception of her own. In what forms a comment on language in general, the deictic construction and mentally projected world produced by this narrative is shown to be counterfeit. Munro, who has deliberately cultivated an embodied reader presence within the narrative, forcibly ejects the reader (Stockwell would refer to this as a POP - Stockwell 2002: 40) from their (albeit fictionalised) presence in the narrative, as the text world itself collapses. I argue Munro deliberately exploits the power of pronominal reference throughout her story, cultivating certain emotive relationships that transgress the conventional text world/discourse world divide, only to undercut such a process and foreground the inherent artifice of the emotive response the text has commanded. Such a narrative climax is only attainable, and indeed it seems Munro has this in mind throughout, through the inherent ambiguity and call to relationship contained within the doubly deictic pronoun 'You.'

Narrative implication and manipulation of this kind, I argue, is not only at work in literary fiction, but also appears unnoticed in many verbal and textual situations one engages with everyday. Society's relationship to music, particularly in adolescence, is seen to take a powerful role in the lives of those who listen, in self-definition, the mediation of trauma (particularly failed relationships), and in formulating and expressing complex emotions. Consider, for example, how many times one has heard friends or family express deeply personal reactions to certain songs. My interest in this subject, expressed through this study and, indeed, my previous project (*Shifting Visions of the Self*), was borne out of a conversation with a friend of mine, who commented that the song 'If I Were a Boy' by Beyonce Knowles (2008) was, 'her song,' declaring that it 'spoke' to her personally. It is my argument that such relationships with certain songs are due, in part, to this disorientating effect of doubly deictic pronouns, which actively and deliberately co-opt people into to feeling implicated in the narrative, the words taking a perceived resonance in the life of the listener.

One might argue such evidence is anecdotal and symptomatic only of an adolescent reaction to popular music, yet such a phenomenon is well documented on commercial radio. Radio1, among the most popular radio stations in the UK, has a daily feature where listeners are encouraged to send in a request for a song that has impacted their life. Each 'Changing Track,' is also preceded by a short account from the listener, who describes the particular autobiographical memory that connects them to the song. Typically, the stories retell periods of intense emotional instability or adversity that are overcome by a change of attitude, the intervention of friends and family, or fortuitous circumstances. Often, the song itself is perceived to take up a transformative position within the life of the listener, or to represent the period of tribulation itself – fixing ephemeral experience (Oatley 2003: 162) into a tangible object that can be replayed and relived endlessly.

In one striking example aired in March 2008, a listener named 'Laura' sent in a story to accompany the song 'She Will Be Loved' (Levine and Valentine 2004), a song which mixes first, second and third person address, by American pop-rock band, Maroon 5. Appearing on their album *Songs About Jane* (see appendix for full lyrics), the song was released in August 2004, reaching number four in the UK singles chart and was one of the most popular songs of that summer. Her story concerns how the song reminds her of an important romantic relationship during her adolescence (see appendix (ii) for a full transcript).

'Laura' has clearly developed a deeply personal relationship with the narrative of this song, which can be understood when read alongside the lyrics of 'She Will Be Loved.' The song, opening with the lines, 'Beauty queen of only eighteen/She had some trouble with herself' is clearly constructed so that young women such as Laura may easily read the content

of their own lives onto the song. The narrative introduces a generalized female protagonist – an attractive, teenage pageant winner with problems. The addressee of this narrative is, therefore, in their very nature both idealized and indistinct, borne out of the non-visual, purely vocal format of recorded songs, so that the listener (in this case, a lonely, insecure schoolgirl called Laura) is able to recognize something of their own autobiographical experience in the lyrics. The locus of this identification is centred on the use of the second person pronoun 'You' (in the form of 'your') in the chorus. Although obviously *not* referring to Laura, it has clearly drawn her in,

'I don't mind spending everyday Out on your corner in the pouring rain Look for the girl with the broken smile Ask her if she wants to stay a while.'

(Levine and Valentine 2004)

Importantly, one notes the alignment between the narrative content of the song – unrequited love, depression and perseverance – with Laura's own personal memories. It is this sense of interaction, between her personal 'baggage', which has guided the emotive response to the text, and the textual construction of the song, which has produced the above reaction. Kuiken et.al (2004) have suggested that self-implication in narrative occurs 'frequently among individuals who remain depressed about a significant loss that occurred some time ago' (Kuiken et.al 2004: 171). Although Laura's story has nothing to do with bereavement, it is clear a specific area of her life - self-esteem in relation to the opposite sex - was problematic for a sustained period. The song, which contains this theme, can be seen to exploit this deficiency, Levine and Valentine clearly aware that problematic relationships are big business in the music industry.

What is fascinating about this reaction to this song, and what the 'Changing Tracks,' attitude to popular music takes for granted, is that each one represents a categorical misreading of the original authorial intention. In truth, 'She Will Be Loved,' has nothing to do with 'Laura' at all. The song, from the album *Songs About Jane*, is actually about Levine, and his failed relationship with his ex-girlfriend, Jane. Emotional and experiential mapping that stretches interpretation in this way is symptomatic of 'Changing Tracks.' Yet, it is important to articulate, that misreadings of this sort – that which displace an individuals egocentric experience onto an alien textual form - are neither unusual nor seen as irrational in our society. Rather, I argue it is *a* if not *the* predominant way in which readers construct an understanding of such a text. Further, it seems that to the music industry, such a phenomenon is very profitable and is hence widely exploited. This may sound controversial, but a short consideration of this year's most successful records shows that in 2009 (as of 13/05/09), of the eight songs that have reached number one in the UK this year, seven contained at least one instance of second person address, and four predominated in second person narration throughout. Consider, the no doubt familiar,

- 1.) Lily Allen The Fear
- 'And when do you think it'll all become clear?'
- 2.) Kelly Clarkson My Life Would Suck Without You
- 'My life would suck without you.'
- 3.) Flo Rida ft Kesha Right Round
- 'You spin my head right round, right round.'
- 4.) Jenkins, West, Jones and Gibb Islands in the Stream
- 'I can't live without you.'

```
5.) Lady Gaga – Poker Face
```

I do not argue that each and every one of these songs will have a uniform connective reaction with each receiver of the text, but it seems to be a feature of modern popular music to contain a latent emotive action potential, which lays in wait for a receiver who is cognitively predisposed through their emotional history, to actively read their experiences into the lyrical content of the song.

This phenomenon, I argue, serves to validate a central tenet of cognitive poetics, of language and literature as a 'specific form of everyday human experience' (Gavins and Steen 2003: 1), and what Johnson-Laird (1983) has articulated as the formative role of language in cognition. Johnson-Laird writes, 'a major function of language is to enable us to experience the world by proxy' (Johnson-Laird 1983:471). Assertions of this type are also widely held within the study of music itself, Longhurst suggesting that, 'audiences often *feel* words and music, and develop them in their imaginations…pop love songs do not reflect emotions, then, but give people the romantic terms in which to articulate and so experience their emotions' (Longhurst 1995: 173).

Such words, no doubt would form an eloquent finish to a project regarding the power and pervasiveness of the second person pronoun in literature. However, I argue that such a conclusion, pertaining to the centrality of second person address in song lyrics in the formative production of interactive emotions creates more problems than it solves. In fact, I would argue that if one is willing to accept the conclusions made in reference to 'She Will Be Loved,' one cannot delimit the power of pronominal address to invoke receiver projection.

As one noted regarding 'She Will Be Loved,' and the other hit singles of 2009, each utilises a mixed mode of narration, not strictly speaking predominated by the first, second or third person. The presence of these other forms of narration does not, however, limit the implicative power of the songs; readers often aligning themselves with the 'I' or in some cases the 'He/She' of a text. Recent textual analyses and cognitive research is already, in my opinion moving towards such expansion.

Marcus (2008a; 2008b) has recently argued convincingly for the application of Herman's double deixis framework to the first person plural 'We,' writing 'the pronoun...represents neither a stable community nor a well defined word view or system of values' (Marcus 2008b: 18). Additionally, research by Tettamanti et.al (2005) and Brunyé et.al (2009), suggests that the pronoun 'I' should also be reconsidered in light of Herman's framework. Brunyé et.al have suggested that readers 'dynamically adopt different perspectives,' (Brunyé et.al 2009) throughout the reading process, the mode of narration often governing such perspective taking. Their research has suggested that 'I or you may promote mental simulation from an internal (first-person) perspective, whereas third-person pronouns from an external (third person) perspective' (Brunyé et.al 2009: 28).

Such conclusions are far from speculation, as research by Tettamanti et.al has shown that first-person textual stimulus has a quantifiable cognitive effect. Their research has provided evidence, 'that listening to sentences that describe actions engages the visuomotor circuits which subserve action execution...' (Tettamanti et.al 2005: 273) in the brain. Therefore, it would seem that to read first-person narrative, is to be mentally subsumed and

<sup>- &#</sup>x27;I won't tell you that I love you.'

<sup>6.)</sup> Calvin Harris – *I'm Not Alone* –

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Can you stay up for the weekend?'

<sup>7.)</sup> Tinchy Stryder ft N-dubz – Number 1 –

<sup>&#</sup>x27;See now I don't understand how you're number one.'3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Information regarding all songs accessed online at <a href="http://theofficialcharts.com/">http://theofficialcharts.com/</a> [01/05/09]

coerced into the narrative on a cognitive level. This psychological research suggests that in first person narratives one cannot avoid an emotional attachment (expressed through a projected ontological affinity) with the narrator figure. It seems one cannot read fiction, therefore, without cognitively enacting the fiction. I argue this is why first-person novels with controversial subject matter – consider *First Love, Last Rights* (1975) by Ian McEwan, which includes depictions of rape, incest and murder, or *Time's Arrow* (1991), which depicts the Holocaust from the perspective of a concentration camp physician - can be so intensely engaging and repelling.

Yet this displacement does not simply apply to deviant or harrowing texts, but as I argue, this inevitable egocentric projection is at work in all literature. Consider, for example, the lyrics of 'She Will Be Loved.' An alternative reading, or idiosyncratic mental projection of the text, could equally be taken through the embodied visual and psychological perspective of the 'I' figure, as the agent of restorative affection in the narrative. Considering the evidence presented in both my studies in this field, I would argue, therefore, a general principle of egocentricity be applied to all forms of reading, arguing that all pronominal reference has the ability to coerce a reader into adopting an embodied, alternative perspective. The allure of shifting perspectives, put to work with such intensity and utilised so readily in reactions to popular music must, I argue, transform the way in which one understands the relationship of narrative to the individual in general. The study of literature, which values authorial intention, is unable to cope with this sense of egocentric projection, a necessary acceptance of the productive interaction between the reader and the text, because it destabilises and devalues the creative vision of the individual writer. Cognitive poetics too, for all it insights into the mechanics of reading and interpretation, I believe, does not take the full implications of egocentricity seriously enough. Functioning to analyse general patterns of reading, cognitive poetics seems unwilling to integrate deviant readings, or misreadings of texts within its analytical frameworks. I argue that this study of second-person narration provides evidence that the reading process is always idiosyncratic, and must always be considered as an interactive process between a text and a person, the idiosyncrasies of which are still not given enough primacy in the study of literary texts.

#### **Appendices**

#### i) 'She Will Be Loved' by Maroon 5 -

Beauty queen of only eighteen She had some trouble with herself He was always there to help her She always belonged to someone else

I drove for miles and miles And wound up at your door I've had you so many times but somehow I want more

I don't mind spending everyday
Out on your corner in the pouring rain
Look for the girl with the broken smile
Ask her if she wants to stay awhile
And she will be loved
She will be loved

Tap on my window knock on my door I want to make you feel beautiful I know I tend to get so insecure It doesn't matter anymore

It's not always rainbows and butterflies It's compromise that moves us along, yeah My heart is full and my door's always open You can come anytime you want

I don't mind spending everyday
Out on your corner in the pouring rain
Look for the girl with the broken smile
Ask her if she wants to stay awhile
And she will be loved

I know where you hide
Alone in your car
Know all of the things that make you who you are
I know that goodbye means nothing at all
Comes back and begs me to catch her every time she falls

Tap on my window knock on my door I want to make you feel beautiful

I don't mind spending everyday Out on your corner in the pouring rain Look for the girl with the broken smile 296 'I have my tricks and trap doors too':
Double Deixis, Reader Investment and Self-Identification in Literature and Popular Music.

Ask her if she wants to stay awhile And she will be loved And she will be loved And she will be loved And she will be loved

[In the background]
Please don't try so hard to say goodbye
Please don't try so hard to say goodbye
Yeah

# ii) Laura's Story – accessed online at <a href="http://jwfc.niceboards.net/changing-tracks-f1/changing-track-05-03-08-t10.htm">http://jwfc.niceboards.net/changing-tracks-f1/changing-track-05-03-08-t10.htm</a> [11/05/09]

Four years ago I had a really hard time at school. I had never been unpopular, but I had a failed relationship with a guy that everyone was friends with, and eventually, this lead to trouble for me. I became the scapegoat for everyone around to just pick me apart. The people I once counted on as my friends, now began to bully me. But things were to change, I went on a school trip to Spain and I started to talk to one particular guy. He made me feel good again and we started to go out. It was not all plain sailing as for the next few months we were on and off as I struggled to accept that someone could like me for me. Unfortunately in the end we broke up, but we did remain friends while we were at school. However when I left a couple of years ago, we lost contact. We still live in the same town, but we go to different colleges and consequently we never see each other anymore. I want to dedicate this track to him because I know it reminds us both of these few months when he rebuilt my trust and my confidence. I just want to thank him so much because I don't think he realizes how much he changed my life. Because of him, I came out of a bad place, and I want to show him how much I appreciate what he did for me.'

#### **Bibliography**

### **Primary Texts:**

- Munro, A. (1990) 'Tell Me Yes or No,' in *Something I've Been Meaning to Tell You*, (Toronto, Penguin Books), pp.106-124.
- Levine, A and Valentine, J (2004) 'She Will Be Loved,' from *Songs About Jane* (New York: Octone Records).
- Laura's Story accessed online at <a href="http://jwfc.niceboards.net/changing-tracks-f1/changing-track-05-03-08-t10.htm">http://jwfc.niceboards.net/changing-tracks-f1/changing-track-05-03-08-t10.htm</a> [11/05/09]

#### **Secondary Texts:**

- Arnold, JE and Griffin, ZM. (2007) 'The Effect of Additional Characters on Choice of referring Expression: Everyone Counts,' in *Journal of Memory and Language*, Vol.56, Elsevier, pp.521-36.
- Brunyé, TT; Ditman, T; Mahoney, CR; Augustyn, JS; and Taylor HA. (2008) 'When You and I Share Perspectives: Pronouns Modulate Perspective Taking During Narrative Comprehension,' in *Psychological Science* Vol.20, No.1, Association of Psychological Science, pp.27-32.
- Cohn, MA; Mehl, MR and Pennebaker, JW. (2004) 'Linguistic Markers of Psychological Change Surrounding September 11, 2001,' in *Psychological Science*, Vol.15, No.10, American Psychological Society, pp.687-693.
- Colle, L; Baron-Cohen, S; Weelwright, S; and van der Lely, HKJ. (2008) 'Narrative Discourse in Adults with High-Functioning Autism or Asperger Syndrome,' in Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders, Vol.38, Iss.1, pp.28-40.
- Cornis-Pope, M. (1994) 'From Cultural Provocation to Narrative Cooperation: Innovative Uses of the Second Person in Raymond Federman's Fiction,' in *Style* Vol.28, Iss.3, DeKalb, p.411ff.
- Dale, PS and Crain-Thoreson, C. (1993) 'Pronoun Reversals: Who, When and Why?' in *Journal of Child Language*, Vol.20, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp.573-589.
- Dijikic, M; Oatley, K; Zoeterman, S and Peterson, JB. (2009) 'On Being Moved by Art: How Reading Fiction Transforms the Self,' in *Creativity Research Journal*, Vol.21, No.1, Taylor and Francis Group, LLC, pp.24-29.
- Fludernik, M. (1994) 'Second-Person Narrative as A Test Case for Narratology: the Limits of Realism,' in *Style* Vol.28, Iss.3, DeKalb, p.445ff.
- Fludernik, M. (1995) 'Pronouns of Address and 'Odd' Third Person Forms: The Mechanics of Involvement in Fiction.' in K.Green (ed.) *New Essays in Deixis*, Amsterdam, Rodopi, pp.99-129.

- Double Deixis, Reader Investment and Self-Identification in Literature and Popular Music.
- Herman, D. (1994) 'Textual You and Double Deixis in Edna Obrien's 'A Pagan Place,' in *Style*, Vol.28, No.3: pp.378-410.
- Järvikivi, J; van Gompel, RPG; Hyönä, J; and Bertram, R. (2005) 'Ambiguous Pronoun Resolution: Contrasting the First-Mention and Subject-Preference Accounts,' in *Psychological Science* Vol.16, No.4, Association of Psychological Science, pp.260-264.
- Kacandes, I. (1994) 'Narrative Apostrophe: Reading, Rhetoric, Resistance in Michel Butor's La Modification and Julio Cortazar's "Graffiti." 'in *Style* Vol.28, Iss.3, DeKalb, p.329ff.
- Kelter, S; Kaup, B; and Claus, B; (2004) 'Representing a Described Sequence of Events: A Dynamic View of Narrative Comprehension,' in *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory and Cognition*, Vol.30, No.2, American Psychological Association Inc, pp.451-464.
- Kuiken, D., Miall, D. S. and Sikora, S. (2004), 'Forms of Self-Implication in Literary Reading', *Poetics Today*, 25, (2), 171-203.
- Longhurst, B (1995) *Popular Music and Society* (Cambridge: Polity Press)
- Lewis, M and Carmody, DP. (2008) 'Self-Representation and Brain Development,' in *Developmental Psychology*, Vol.44, No.5, American Psychological Association, pp.1329-1334.
- Marcus, A. (2008a) 'A Contextual View of Narrative Fiction in the First Person Plural,' in *Narrative*, Vol.16, No.1, The Ohio State University, accessed on <a href="http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/narrative/v016/16.1marcus.pdf">http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/narrative/v016/16.1marcus.pdf</a>> [21/04/08]
- Marcus, A. (2008b) 'We are You: The Plural and the Dual in "We" Fictional Narratives,' in *Journal of Literary Semantics*, Vol.37, Iss.1, Walter de Gruyter, p.1-21.
- Mildorf, J. (2006) 'Sociolinguistic Implications of Narratology: Focalization and 'Double Deixis' in Conversational Storytelling,' in *Studies across Disciplines in the Humanities and Social Sciences*, ed. by Hyvärinen, M; Korhonen, A; Mykkänen, Helsinki Collegium for Advanced Studies, Vol.1, pp.42-59.
- Mildorf, J. 'Sociolinguistic Implications of Narratology: Focalization and Double Deixis in Conversational Storytelling,' in *Studies across Disciplines in the Humanities and Social Sciences 1*, Helsinki, Helsinki Collegium for Advanced Studies, pp.42-59, Accessed on <a href="http://helsinki.fi/collegium/e-series/volumes/volume\_1/001\_05\_mildorf.pdf">http://helsinki.fi/collegium/e-series/volumes/volume\_1/001\_05\_mildorf.pdf</a>> [21/04/09]
- Nance, KA. 'Self-Consuming Second-Person Fiction: Jose Emilio Pacheo's "Tarde de Agosto" ("August Afternoon"), in *Style* Vol.28, Iss.3, DeKalb, p.366ff.
- Oatley, K. (2003) 'Writingandreading: The future of Cognitive Poetics' in *Cognitive Poetics In Practice*, ed. by Joanna Gavins and Gerard Steen, London: Routledge.
- O'Neill, DK and Shultis RM. (2007) 'The Emergence of the Ability to Track a Character's Mental Perspective in Narrative,' *Developmental Psychology*, Vol.43, No.4, American Psychological Association, pp.1032–1037.
- INNERVATE Leading Undergraduate Work in English Studies, Volume 1 (2008-2009), pp. 285-300

- Oshima-Takane, Y; Takane, Y and Shultz, TR. (1999) 'The Learning of First and Second Person Pronouns in English: Network Models and Analysis,' in *Journal of Child Language*, Vol.26, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp.545-575.
- Pérez-Pereira, M. (1999) 'Deixis, Personal Reference, and the Use of Pronouns by Blind Children,' in *Journal of Child Language*, Vol.26, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp.655-680.
- Phelan, J. (1994) 'Self-help for Narratee and Narrative Audience: How "I" and "You"? read "How" 'in *Style* Vol.28, Iss.3, DeKalb, p.350ff.
- Raskin, R and Shaw, R. (2006) 'Narcissism and the Use of Personal Pronouns,' in *Journal of Personality*, Vol.56, Iss.2, Wiley Periodicals Inc, pp.393-404.
- Ricard, M; Girouard, PC and Deciare, TG. (1999) 'Personal Pronouns and Perspective Taking in Toddlers,' in *Journal of Child Language*, Vol.26, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp.681-697.
- Richardson, B. (1994) 'I etcetera: On the Poetics and Ideology of Multipersoned Narratives,' in *Style*, Vol.28, Iss.3, DeKalb, p.312ff.
- Rohrbaugh, MJ; Mehl, MR; Shoham, V; Reilly, ES and Ewy, GA. (2008) 'Prognostic Significance of Spouse We Talk in Couples Coping With Heart Failure,' in *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, Vol.76, No.5, American Psychological Association, pp.781-789.
- Schulkind, MD; Hennis, LK and Rubin, DC. (1999) 'Music, Emotion, and Autobiographical Memory: They're Playing Your Song,' in *Memory and Cognition*, Vol.27, Psychosonic Society Inc, pp.948-955.
- Semino, E. (1995) 'Deixis and the Dynamics of the Poetic Voice,' in K.Green (ed.) *New Essays in Deixis*, Amsterdam, Rodopi, pp.145-160.
- Semino, E. (1992) 'Building on Keith Green's 'Deixis and the Poetic Persona': Further Reflections on Deixis in Poetry' in M.Toolan (ed.) *Language and Literature* 1(2), London: Longman, pp134-140.
- Seih, YT; Lin, YC; Huang, CL; Peng, CW and Huang, SP. (2008) 'The Benefits of Psychological Displacement in Diary Writing when using Different Pronouns,' in *British Journal of Health Psychology*, Vol.13, The British Psychological Society, pp.39-41.
- Stevenson, R; Knott, A; Oberlander, J; and McDonald, S. (2000) 'Interpreting Pronouns and Connectives: Interactions among Focussing, Thematic Roles and Coherence Relations,' in *Language and Cognitive Processes*, Vol.15, Iss.3, pp.225-262.
- Straiton, A. (2009) Shifting Visions of the Self: Deixis in William Shakespeare's Sonnet 129 and Connor Oberst's Land Locked Blues (essay, available on request).

Tettamanti, M; Buccino, G; Saccuman, MC; Gallese, V; Danna, M; Scifo, P; Fazio, F; Rizzolatti, G; Cappa, SF; Perani, D. (2005) 'Listening to action-related sentences activates froto-parietal motor circuits,' in Journal of Cognitive Neuroscience, Vol.17, Iss.2, MIT Press pp.273-281.

Werth, P. (1999) Text Worlds: Representing Conceptual Space in Discourse (Harlow: Longman).