



COUNCIL

Minutes of the Meeting held on 20 March 2023

Present: Sir Keith O’Nions (Chair), Pearl Agyakwa, Sultan Chaudhury, Lynette Eastman (via Teams), Rachel Gomes, Michelle Haslem, Sonya Leydecker, Jo Lymn (until minute 4045), Piyali Mitra, Stephen Odell, Nora Senior, Shearer West

Apologies: River Butterworth, Ruwan Kodikara, Sherry Madera, Richard Newsome, Jane Norman, Stuart Reeves

In attendance: Alison Dubas (minutes), Paul Greatrix (Registrar), Rowena Hall (Associate Director of Governance and Executive Services), Rosemary Madagwa (Governance Apprentice from minute 4033), Margaret Monckton (CFO), Rakesh Sharma (Observing), Jason Carter (Director of Governance and Assurance for minutes 4034 and 4039), Kev Thompson (Associate Director of Risk Management for minute 4034), Ruth Eccles (Head of Professional and Work Based Learning for minute 4035 and 4036), Alison Reeves (Associate Director Educational Excellence for minutes 4035 and 4036), Sarah Speight (PVC ESE for minutes 4035 and 4036), David Hill (Chief Digital Officer for minute 4037), Sam Kingman (FPVC Engineering for minutes 4037, 4038 and 4039), Gary Moss (Director of Estates and Facilities for minute 4037), Nalayini Thambar (Director of PPSC for minute 4037), Jon Grainger (Director of Health and Safety for minute 4039), Caroline Glendenning (Programme Manager for minute 4042), Todd Landman (FPVC Social Sciences for minute 4042), David Park (Interim Dean of NUBS for minute 4042), Jeremy Gregory (Chair of the CMC Board for minutes 4043 and 4044), Helen Lawrenson (Director of Financial Management for minutes 4043 and 4044), Jason Phoenix (Castle Meadow Programme Director for minutes 4043 and 4044), Katherine Linehan (PVC EDI and People for minute 4045)

4029 Welcome, Apologies, Quoracy

- .1 The Chair welcomed members to the meeting and the meeting was CONFIRMED quorate.
- .2 RESERVED.

4030 Declarations of Interest

Stephen Odell declared that he had recently commenced a new role. No further action was required in respect of the declaration and it would be added to Stephen’s register of interest entry.

4031 Minutes of the Meeting held 7 February 2023 and Action Log

The minutes of the meeting held 7 February 2023 (paper C/23/16) were APPROVED as an accurate record.

4032 Chair's Business

- .1 Richard Newsome's tenure as an external Council member would end on 31 March 2023. A vote of thanks was NOTED to Richard and his valuable contributions to Council and Audit and Risk Committee business.
- .2 There were no finance related matters on the March agenda as the most recent finance paper considered by Finance Committee had been received by Council at its previous meeting. Finance matters would be included on the following Council meeting agenda.
- .3 Similar to presentations delivered by each Faculty, there would be presentations from Professional Services departments to Council, commencing from the start of the 2023/24 session.
- .4 Professor Joanne Lymn had been appointed as a member of Finance Committee.

4033 Vice-Chancellor's Report

- .1 Council RECEIVED a report from the Vice-Chancellor (paper C/23/20). The following key points were NOTED:
 - .1 Negotiations between UCU and the University continued, on both pay and USS pensions. The current period of industrial action would conclude the next day, but it was possible that there would be further industrial action in the future. During the period students had received regular communications. Under the direction of the PVC Education and Student Experience, contingency regulations had been drafted, in the event there might be gaps in students' assessment profiles as a result of industrial action. Those regulations would be considered by Senate at its next meeting;
 - .2 The University continued to work with the Russell Group and UUK to urge the UK Government to progress the UK's association to EU programmes, including Horizon Europe;
 - .3 The Vice-Chancellor had been appointed as Deputy Chair of the Russell Group;
 - .4 Professor Sir Jonathan Van-Tam would shortly conclude his tenure as interim FPVC Medicine and Health Sciences and would take up the role of Senior Strategy Advisor. A group, chaired by the Deputy Vice-Chancellor, had been convened to understand how plans for the Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences could be progressed and the level of resource required.

4034 University Strategic Risk Register

- .1 Council RECEIVED and NOTED the University Strategic Risk Register (paper C/23/33) from the Vice-Chancellor, supported by the Director of Governance and Assurance and the Associate Director of Risk Management.
- .2 The strategic risk register would become a regular item on future Council agenda. The report would include emerging risks, changes in existing risk severity, risks where it was felt further mitigations were needed and risks that had been de-escalated.

- .3 There was a significant risk related to the poor condition of parts of the University's estate and action was being taken to address the risk, which included a future request for further investment. One of the challenges that had emerged as a result of the condition of the estate was the ageing infrastructure and environmental controls within the Bio Support Unit (BSU), which was a highly regulated area. An internal audit report had made a series of recommendations to respond to the risk. Those recommendations were being actioned, but it was NOTED that a significant level of work was still required.
- .4 Council commended the work undertaken on the strategic risk register and welcomed the regular reporting that would ensue.

4035 Education Performance and Student Satisfaction

- .1 Council RECEIVED the Education Performance and Student Satisfaction report (paper C/23/25) from the PVC Education and Student Experience, supported by the Associate Director of Educational Excellence and the Head of Professional and Work Based Learning.
- .2 Council NOTED the following key points:
 - .1 The four key performance indicators (KPIs) for education and student experience; National Student Survey (NSS) mean score, Access and Participation Plan (APP), graduate outcomes and average tariff;
 - .2 That further work was required to achieve the KPI for NSS. The impact of the pandemic upon NSS scores continued to be experienced and this was a sector wide issue. An action plan to improve NSS scores was being implemented;
 - .3 The Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF) was an external assessment of the quality of undergraduate teaching in higher education. TEF indicators covered student outcomes and student experience. The University had performed well in terms of student outcomes, but work was required to improve the student experience, particularly in the assessment and feedback and student voice measures. Action plans had been developed to address and improve those measures.
- .3 Council members DISCUSSED the action plan to improve NSS scores and engagement with the NSS survey. An internal communications campaign had been launched, designed to encourage students to participate in the NSS and it was NOTED that the University's response rate had improved on the previous year.

4036 Degree Apprenticeships

- .1 Council RECEIVED and NOTED the Degree Apprenticeships report (paper C/23/26) from the PVC Education and Student Experience, supported by the Associate Director of Educational Excellence and the Head of Professional and Work Based Learning.
- .2 In 2021, UEB had approved a programme of activity to establish Degree Apprenticeships, with the aim of expanding the University's support for employers through apprenticeship education and addressing skills gaps. The apprenticeship programme had proven to be successful and the University had almost 350 apprentices across its eight apprenticeship programmes.

- .3 Ofsted had recently conducted its first monitoring visit in respect of the University's apprenticeship provision. The visit was felt to have been positive and the full inspection would take place within the next 18 months.
- .4 Council members recognised the level of work that had resulted in a successful programme of apprenticeships and the benefits that it delivered.

4037 Major Projects Overview

- .1 Council RECEIVED and NOTED the Major Projects Overview report (paper C/23/29) from the Registrar and CFO, supported by the FPVC Engineering, Chief Digital Officer, Director of Planning, Performance and Strategic Change and the Director of Estates and Facilities.
- .2 A presentation supported the paper, which provided a summary of the projects underway and under development, how those projects aligned to the investment pipeline and how the projects would support the delivery of University KPIs.

Project Stay

- .3 The Project Stay group had been convened during 2019 to review and address issues related to student accommodation. Project Stay had two elements, to review and refurbish the University's Halls of Residence and to develop a new vision for student accommodation and to replace Halls that had been identified as unsuitable for refurbishment. Following changes in the market, a review of Project Stay had been initiated in late 2022.
- .4 Numerous conclusions resulted from the Project Stay review including: the University's accommodation offer was inconsistent with its peers; we had a significantly higher proportion of catered accommodation; the University's accommodation was, in many cases, of lower quality, but a higher price than others; and that catered offering was not widely valued by the student population.
- .5 Following the conclusion of the Project Stay review, a new residential strategy had been developed, which aimed to provide additional bedrooms and would also focus upon improving the culture and environment within Halls.

Digital Partner

- .6 Council was reminded that the Digital Partner had been appointed to support the delivery of the University's digital ambitions, address the technical debt and to deliver some of the University's digital services. Phase one of services included the provision of strategic advice and guidance, with the development of roadmaps and recommendations for future services.
- .7 Phase two of the partnership progressed and would focus upon the delivery of a new next generation network service, which Council NOTED would be approximately a £30m investment. The next generation network would be on the May 2023 agenda of Council and would be an opportunity for initial consideration of the case ahead of its submission for approval later in 2023.

Asset Replacement Programme

- .8 Although a significant level of work had progressed over recent years to address the estate maintenance backlog, considerable work was still required and it was

anticipated that the backlog would cost in excess of £100m to resolve. A business case would be submitted to Council at its June 2023 meeting to request £45m capital investment, phased across three financial years.

- .9 The district heating network at University Park was a £30m multi phase programme to replace the ageing heating network. The current heating system was inefficient and the replacement programme would be a sustainable heat source and would support the decarbonisation of the University's estate.
- .10 The Trent Building also required considerable refurbishment to address the ageing infrastructure, building fabric and removal of any remaining asbestos.

Investment Pipeline

- .11 Council NOTED that, since the initial development of the investment pipeline, there were likely to be revisions as new projects emerged that needed to be prioritised. For instance, a proposal to expand the School of Computer Science had been developed and there were ongoing discussions around the plans for the Medical School building.
- .12 Work would be undertaken to refine how projects were categorised so that there was a shared understanding of the definition of a strategic project. At the point where a business case was submitted to Council, the case would clearly identify how it aligned to the University strategy and would deliver against the KPIs.

4038 Research Performance: Progress and Next Steps

- .1 Council RECEIVED and NOTED the Research Performance Progress and Next Steps report (paper C/23/30) from the Interim PVC RKE.
- .2 The paper summarised progress on University research performance via the research KPIs. Although there were many examples of outstanding research within the University, collective performance still required improvement. Initiatives within the research strategic delivery plan would support enhanced investment in research and innovation.
- .3 Council DISCUSSED the University's research performance, how it benchmarked against comparator Institutions and whether the targets and KPIs within the research strategic delivery plan were sufficiently ambitious. The Interim PVC RKE reported that caution had been exercised when setting targets and KPIs and it was felt they were realistic and achievable. However, targets would be reviewed and revisited periodically, to assess whether they should be updated.
- .4 The Interim PVC RKE outlined his priorities over the coming months, which included improving research performance and addressing challenges around Trusted Research. Members NOTED the Interim PVC RKE's intention to submit a report to Council within the next six months to report on performance and progression against each of the priorities.

4039 Health and Safety

- .1 Council RECEIVED and NOTED the Health and Safety Report (paper C/23/17) and Report from the Health and Safety Committee (paper C/23/32) from the Chair of Health and Safety Committee, supported by the Director of Governance and Assurance and the Director of Health and Safety.

- .2 Good progress had been made in respect of health and safety across the University, particularly in the areas of fire safety, water hygiene and the management and addressing of asbestos. The Director of Health and Safety had undertaken a full review of health and safety and had presented the outcome and a series of recommendations to the Health and Safety Committee for consideration. The recommendations would be presented to both UEB and Planning and Resources Committee to ensure that sufficient resource would be available to implement required actions.
- .3 The Director of Health and Safety provided Council with an overview of initial findings following the review of health and safety at the University. Some areas of good health and safety practice had been identified, but those practices were inconsistent and a strategy to address these inconsistencies would be developed.
- .4 Council welcomed the report and NOTED the ongoing work to improve health and safety at the University.

4040 Remuneration Committee Review Report

- .1 Council RECEIVED the Remuneration Committee Review Report (paper C/23/27) from the Vice-Chair of Council, supported by the Director of HR, which set out the approach taken in reviewing the Remuneration Committee and a series of recommendations that had resulted.
- .2 A working group had been convened to conduct a consultation exercise and develop a series of recommendations to clarify the responsibilities of Remuneration Committee and identify actions to strengthen and inform decision making.
- .3 Following the review, several changes to the Remuneration Committee's terms of reference were proposed, which were outlined within the paper. One of the key changes was that the Committee should approve a remuneration policy and reward strategy for all senior staff.
- .4 Another recommendation following the review was to reduce the size of the Remuneration Committee's membership to either five or six external members of Council. The membership and Chair would be determined by Nominations Committee.
- .5 Remuneration Committee meetings should be scheduled at such times that relevant benchmarking data would be available to support decision making. As such, it was proposed to hold two meetings a year in October and April. A meeting should be scheduled for July 2023 as part of transitional arrangements to consider the recommendations of the report.
- .6 Council APPROVED the recommendations within the Remuneration Committee Review Report. The April 2023 meeting of Nominations Committee would begin to consider the membership of the Remuneration Committee.

4041 The Role of Senate

- .1 Council RECEIVED the Role of Senate paper (C/23/31) from the Registrar.
- .2 Following an effectiveness review of Senate, a series of recommendations had been developed, one of which was that Council be invited to clarify the role of Senate. At its October 2022 meeting, Council had agreed that Ordinance XV would

be revised and distilled to focus clearly on the primary responsibilities of Senate. The revised Ordinance was presented to Council for its consideration.

- .3 Council DISCUSSED the following key points:
 - .1 The proposed removal of point eight from Ordinance XV, which was to expel, suspend or exclude any student, subject in each case to subsequent report to Council. Some Council members expressed that Council should receive such reports and be informed of statistics and trends. The Registrar advised that student disciplinary cases were dealt with according to the student code of discipline, which was currently undergoing revision. Reports and statistics on student suspensions would be periodically reported to Council;
 - .2 The proposed removal of point 15, which was 'to discuss and to declare an opinion on any matter whatsoever related to the University'. It was recognised that Senate meetings were not the sole mechanism to discuss University related matters with the Vice-Chancellor and senior leaders, there were multiple routes, which included town hall events for each Faculty and Professional Services department;
 - .3 That Senate's role, as the academic body of the University, was to oversee and deal with matters related to education, teaching and research. Ordinance XV should focus on those areas.
- .4 Council CONFIRMED that the proposed revisions to Ordinance XV should continue to progress. Ahead of the Ordinance being submitted to Council at its May 2023 meeting for final approval, the Registrar would discuss the revisions with UEB and the Senate members on Council, to understand their views on Senate business and the proposed revisions to the Ordinance.

4042 Nottingham University Business School (NUBS) Quality Enhancement and Growth Investment Business Case Phase One

- .1 Council RECEIVED the NUBS Quality Enhancement and Growth Investment paper (C/23/18) from the FPVC Social Sciences, supported by the Programme Manager and Interim Dean of NUBS.
- .2 Council NOTED the following:
 - .1 Finance Committee had approved £5.2m of investment for phase one of the quality enhancement of NUBS;
 - .2 There were significant differences and changes to the case that had been presented to Council the previous year, including the addition of a series of key performance indicators and the four pillars of activity that had been built into the case;
 - .3 The case was underpinned by a modest growth in student numbers, coupled with a transition to the Castle Meadow Campus.
- .3 Council DISCUSSED the timescales associated with the case and an expected date for the delivery of its objectives. It was recognised that there were numerous challenges which could impact upon the delivery of the case, such as external geopolitical risks, however it was thought that good headway could be made within the next two years.

4043 Castle Meadow Campus Report

Council RECEIVED and NOTED the Castle Meadow Campus Report (paper C/23/24).

4044 Castle Meadow Campus Infrastructure Business Case

- .1 Council RECEIVED the Castle Meadow Campus Infrastructure Business Case (paper C/23/22) from the Chair of the Castle Meadow Campus Board supported by the Castle Meadow Programme Director and Director of Financial Management.
- .2 Investment in Castle Meadow Campus (CMC) would take place over a series of phases, supported by a number of other business cases, including the NUBS Quality Enhancement and Growth Investment. The CMC infrastructure business case presented to Council was part of phase two and focussed on getting the campus ready for occupancy.
- .3 Council members DISCUSSED risks associated with the CMC business case and how those risks would be monitored and managed. Risk had been considered throughout all phases of the programme and it was REPORTED that, for example, during engagement with potential suppliers, their risk profile was considered in detail and, when interviewed by University colleagues, suppliers were also asked about the risk profile of their third party suppliers. A 20 percent contingency had also been incorporated into the business case, however, there were strict controls around how that contingency could be accessed and used, should it be required.
- .4 Council NOTED that the CMC business case, and linked business cases such as NUBS, were being monitored in terms of investment and that each case had a capped budget.
- .5 Council APPROVED the CMC Infrastructure Business Case (paper C/23/22) and the £77m funding request contained therein.

4045 Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Annual Report

- .1 Council RECEIVED the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Annual Report (paper C/23/19) from the PVC EDI and People.
- .2 Council NOTED the following key points:
 - .1 A considerable level of work had been undertaken within each of the three EDI priority areas, which were; diversification of the workforce and career development, awareness raising and education and support;
 - .2 A new governance structure had been implemented, whereby the EDI Committee and the People and Human Resources Committee had been merged to form the People and Culture Committee. Progress against EDI priorities would be monitored through the Intersectionality and Inclusion Oversight Group;
 - .3 The new People and Culture Strategic Delivery Plan (SDP) would continue to be implemented and that EDI would be embedded throughout all other SDPs to ensure that EDI was considered in all business and activity.

4046 Finance Committee Report

Council RECEIVED and NOTED the report from the Finance Committee meeting of 22 February 2023 (paper C/23/23).

4047 Nominations Committee Report

Council RECEIVED and NOTED the report from the Nominations Committee meeting of 7 February 2023 (paper C/23/28).

4048 Council Agenda Forward Plan

Council RECEIVED and NOTED the Forward Plan (paper C/23/21).

4049 Suspensions and Discipline Cases

The Registrar REPORTED that, since the last meeting of Council, one student had been temporarily excluded from all parts of the University, including residential accommodation, and one student had been temporarily excluded from campus.