

Pre and Post-Darwinian Perspectives on Islamic Theological Anthropology

An online conference

Conference dates
10 and 11 June 2023

More information can be found at nottingham.ac.uk/go/trs-events

Content

Introduction	1
Schedules	
10 th June 2023	2
11 th June 2023	2
Abstracts	
Al-Māturīdī's Perspectival Account of Human Distinctiveness David Solomon Jalajel (Saudi Arabia)	3
The Human Revealed: <i>Kalāmic</i> Anthropology in Al-Māturīdī's <i>Tā'wīlāt al-Qur'ān</i> Arnold Yasin Mol (Netherlands)	4
Theological Anthropology in the Late Sunnī Kalām Tradition Hamza Karamali (Turkey)	5
Language and Human Uniqueness: An Exploration of Abū Muḥammad ibn Mattawayh's (d. after 415/1025) Discussions of Speech and Language Laura Hassan (UK)	6
Islamic Theological Anthropology and the Origins of Language: What was Adam Taught? Shoaib Ahmed Malik (UAE) and Mansur Ali (UK)	7
How Free are Human Beings? Ibrahīm al-Madhārī's (d. 1776) Exhaustive List of Sixteen Islamic Positions on Human Freedom in <i>Al-Lumʿah</i> Karim Kocsenda (UAE)	8
Finding <i>Fitra</i> : Scriptural and Theological Divides on Human Nature <i>Students</i> Ramon Harvey (UK)	9
Human Uniqueness in the Ecotheological Context: Moltmann and Nasr in Conversation Sevcan Öztürk (Turkey)	10
Human Nature According to the 'Alawī/Nuṣayrī Doctrinal Literature Annunziata Russo (Italy)	11
Tracing the Adamic Link through an Islamic Jurisprudential (<i>fiqh</i>) Matrix on Human Uniqueness and Nature Rafaqat Rashid (UK)	12
Adamic Exceptionalism Rejuvenated? Islamic Theological and Legal Perspectives on Interspecies Mating between Humans and the <i>Jinn</i> Massoud Vahedi (Canada)	13

Introduction

Since its inception, Charles Darwin's theory of evolution has been surrounded by theological controversy; some religious traditions embrace the science while others reject it outright; still, others represent a complex spectrum of intermediate positions. Among the several areas of discussion taking place in this territory, the notions of (1) human *uniqueness* and (2) human *nature* have hardly received any consideration from Islamic perspectives (in contrast to the several publications by Christian thinkers in this area). The theory of evolution suggests that humans are continuous with the rest of the biological kingdom in time and space. Moreover, developments in human evolution have revealed that there were many other hominins prior to and, at one point, existing alongside Homo sapiens, the species to which modern-day humans belong. In light of these developments, this online conference is an invitation to develop Islamic perspectives on human *uniqueness* and *nature* both in the pre- and post-Darwinian eras.

We warmly welcome you to our conference 'Pre- and Post-Darwinian Perspectives on Islamic Theological Anthropology', which will provide a lively forum for a range of international scholars to discuss their findings on what it means to be distinctively human from Islamic perspectives.

The conference is free of charge and will take place online, using the Microsoft Teams platform. Advance registration is essential; participants can register by clicking here.

We would be delighted for you to join us. If you have questions that this booklet does not answer, please contact jon.hoover@nottingham.ac.uk.

Jon Hoover (University of Nottingham, UK) Shoaib Ahmed Malik (Cambridge Muslim College, UK)

Schedules (timings are in BST) 10th June 2023

Time	Speaker(s)	Торіс	
11.50 AM	Jon Hoover and Shoaib Ahmed Malik	Introductions and Welcome	
12.00 PM	David Solomon Jalajel	Al-Māturīdī's Perspectival Account of Human Distinctiveness	
12.40 PM	Arnold Yasin Mol	The Human Revealed: <i>Kalāmic</i> Anthropology in Al-Māturīdī's <i>Tā'wīlāt al-Qur'ān</i>	
1.20 PM	Hamza Karamali	Theological Anthropology in the Late Sunnī Kalām Tradition	
2.00 PM	30 MINUTE BREAK		
2.30 PM	Laura Hassan	Language and Human Uniqueness: An Exploration of Abū Muḥammad ibn Mattawayh's (d. after 415/1025) Discussions of Speech and Language	
3.10 PM	Shoaib Ahmed Malik and Mansur Ali	Islamic Theological Anthropology and the Origins of Language: What was Adam Taught?	

11th June 2023

Time	Speaker(s)	Торіс
12.00 PM	Karim Kocsenda	How Free are Human Beings? Ibrahīm al- Madhārī's (d. 1776) Exhaustive List of Sixteen Islamic Positions on Human Freedom in <i>Al-Lumʿah</i>
12.40 PM	Ramon Harvey	Finding <i>Fitra</i> : Scriptural and Theological Divides on Human Nature
1.20 PM	15 MINUTE BREAK	
1.35 PM	Sevcan Öztürk	Human Uniqueness in the Ecotheological Context: Moltmann and Nasr in Conversation
2.15 PM	Annunziata Russo	Human Nature According to the 'Alawī/Nuṣayrī Doctrinal Literature
2.55 PM	15 MINUTE BREAK	
3.10 PM	Rafaqat Rashid	Tracing the Adamic Link through an Islamic Jurisprudential (<i>fiqh</i>) Matrix on Human Uniqueness and Nature
3.50 PM	Massoud Vahedi	Adamic Exceptionalism Rejuvenated? Islamic Theological and Legal Perspectives on Interspecies Mating between Humans and the <i>Jinn</i>

Al-Māturīdī's Perspectival Account of Human Distinctiveness

A central issue in theological anthropology for Muslims thinkers is the position of human beings in the broader scheme of created existence, to what extent and in what ways, human beings are unique and distinctive. The Islamic theologian Abū Manṣūr al-Māturīdī (d. 944) has a unique approach to this question that stems from his theological caution with respect to issues that cannot be known, particularly what falls beyond the clear meaning communicated by the revealed scriptures. It also stems from his metaphysical understanding of how the world operates, particularly how different aspects of the world depend upon each other and how they are distinguished from one another, as elaborated in his *Kitāb al-Tawḥīd*.

Abstract

Form this point of departure, this paper will explore al-Māturīdī's exegetical work Ta'wilāt al-Our'ān with respect to a number of verses that are relevant to the question of human distinctiveness, including the creation in the best of forms (Q. 95:4), the honour and preference of the Children of Adam (Q. 17:70), the verse of the Trust (O. 33:72), the verse of the Witnessing (O. 7:172), and the verses relating to the creation of Adam and the Succession (khilāfa) on Earth (Q. 2:30-35). What emerges from this is a tendency to refer matters of human distinctiveness to what concerns human beings from their own perspective, particularly with respect to their interests and needs, and not in absolute ontological terms. This approach differs from the more prevalent anthropocentric tendencies in classical Islamic thought that emphasise human superiority and privilege. This has relevance to current concerns in theological anthropology, particularly how the theory of human evolution is often understood to challenge humanity's place in the world from being a particularly elevated creation to just another animal. This does not pose a challenge for al-Māturīdī's more cautious and perspectival approach to human distinctiveness.

Author(s)

David Solomon Jalajel

Institution

King Saud University, Saudi Arabia

Key words

Abū Mansūr al-Māturīdī, human distinctiveness, anthropocentrism, perspectivism

The Human Revealed: Kalāmic Anthropology in Al-Māturīdī's Tā'wīlāt al-Our'ān

Within the burgeoning field of theological and philosophical anthropology only a small number of studies deal with the late antique and early medieval period, and of which only a handful look at Islamic perspectives. This is while the discipline of Islamic scholastic thought ('ilm al-kalām) provides a treasure trove for theophilosophical anthropology which deserves to be designated as *kalāmic* anthropology, similarly to the specialized fields of Patristic and Rabbinic anthropology. The significant but little-studied medieval thinker Abū Manṣūr al-Māturīdī (d. 333/944) provides us in his *Tā wīlāt al-Our ān* one of the earliest studies of scholastic or *kalāmic* exegesis. Theo-philosophical anthropology and its subjects of intellect, free will, belief, moral responsibility, historicity, religious and cultural diversity, and body, soul and (im)mortality are all explicitly or implicitly referred to in the Qur'ān. By looking at al-Māturīdī's exegesis of verses in relation to (1) intellect, (2) its related subjects of free will, and (3) moral responsibility, part of his *kalāmic* anthropology can be reconstructed. This provides insight into his engagement with existing and emerging theophilosophical anthropologies and can be compared to views discussed in other early medieval exegeses. In doing so, al-Māturīdī provides insights into the social and intellectual milieus of the early medieval formative period of Islamic thought.

Abstract

Author(s) Arnold Yasin Mol

Institution Leiden University, Netherlands
Islamic University of Applied Sciences Rotterdam, Netherlands

Key words Theological anthropology, kalāmic anthropology, al-Māturīdī, tafsīr studies, ethics of belief, moral responsibility

Title Theological Anthropology in the Late Sunnī Kalām Tradition

The nature of human beings and their uniqueness is a longstanding question in Islamic thought. This article begins by carefully defining the meaning of human uniqueness in the Sunnī kalām tradition and then argues affirmatively for human uniqueness based on that tradition as represented by scholars such as Ibrāhīm al-Laqānī (author of the influential Jawharat al-Tawhīd), the Ottoman Seyhulislam and exegete Abu al-Suʻūd, the authors of glosses on the tafsir of Baydāwī, Taqī al-Dīn al-Subkī, al-Khaṭīb al-Shirbīnī., Ibn Ḥajar al-Haytamī, and 'Abd al-Ra'ūf al-Munāwī. It will focus on the classical interpretation Qur'ān of Q. 2:22, 31:20, 17:70 and 95:4; on the Sunnī consensus over the uniqueness of the Prophet Muhammad (God bless him and give him peace); and on the Ash'arī-Māturīdī disagreement over the relative superiority of humans and angels, all to conclude that humans are the most important and potentially most superior creation of God according to Islamic scripture.

Author(s) Hamza Karamali

Abstract

Institution Basira Education, Canada

Key words Theological anthropology, kalām, human uniqueness

Language and Human Uniqueness: An Exploration of Abū Muḥammad Ibn Mattawayh's (d. after 415/1025) Discussions of Speech and Language

The capacity for speech and language is broadly considered to be a critical component of human uniqueness. Classical Muʿtazilī theologians discussed a range of questions relating to the phenomenon of speech. Studying these discussions with an eye to their theoretical context and contents promises to yield insight into how Muʿtazilī theologians conceived of human uniqueness.

Abstract

When discussing speech, the Mu'tazila were interested in the mechanics of its production as well as in theological questions such as the praise or blame-worthy nature of certain speech acts, alongside the contentious question of how speech can be ascribed to God. Speech is a clear point of connection between humanity and the divine, both because divine speech is a key aspect of God's self-revelation and because the capacity to speak is something which God and creatures have in common (all be this entirely equivocally). Yet speech is also a physical process in common with the capacity of other beings to produce sound, and in this regard its analysis is a matter for scientific enquiry. Considering the intersections of the scientific and the theological in Ibn Mattawayh's discussions illuminates facets of his notion of what it is to be human.

I will explore the following questions: how does the physical theoretical content of the Muʿtazilī enquiry into speech and language relate to a theology of human uniqueness? Is the uniquely human capacity to communicate with words considered to set humans apart from other creatures; if so, is this connected to God's communication through created speech? I present a philosophical reflection on these historical discussions, indicating their interest in light of contemporary discussions of human uniqueness in the context of science.

Author(s)

Laura Hassan

Institution

University of Oxford, UK

Key words

Theological anthropology, Speech, Language

Title Islan

Islamic Theological Anthropology and the Origins of Language: What was Adam Taught?

Adamic exceptionalism is the position which claims that scripture neither affirms

nor negates (1) the existence of other biologically human or human-like entities and (2) that Adam's descendants could have interbred with them had they existed. This is contended against because it seems to undermine human nature and uniqueness. One of the contentions is the reference to Adam acquiring language shortly after his creation. The verse being referred to is Q. 2:31: "He taught Adam all the names [of things], then He showed them to the angels and said, 'Tell me the names of these if you truly [think you can]." This verse is being used to suggest that Adam (and, by extension, all humans) is the exclusive creation of God that acquired language and, therefore, other biological humans or human-like entities with language capabilities could not have existed. This eliminates any possibility of the gradual development of language in the history of human evolution. This article will survey the different interpretations of this verse that Muslim exegetists have opined in the *tafsīr* literature, illustrating the variety of hermeneutic options that can be entertained while considering human evolution.

Abstract

Author(s)

Shoaib Ahmed Malik ¹ and Mansur Ali²

Institution

¹Zayed University, United Arab Emirates

²Cardiff University, UK

Key words

Theological anthropology, language, human evolution

How Free are Human Beings? Ibrahīm al-Madhārī's (d. 1776) Exhaustive List of Sixteen Islamic Positions on Human Freedom in *Al-Lum'ah*

Of the many dimensions of theological anthropology, human freedom as a subset of human uniqueness remains a significant problem. This article will analyse for the first time a sweeping catalogue of Islamic positions on free will based on Ibrahīm al-Madhārī's (d. 1776) attempt to offer an exhaustive list of sixteen positions held by various Muslim thinkers and schools on the question of human freedom and agency in his Al-Lum ah fī taḥqīq mabāḥith al-wujūd wa 'l-ḥudūth wa 'l-qadar wa af 'āl al- 'ibād (The Flash of Light in Verifying the Truth on the Questions of Existence, Creation in Time, Predestination, and Human Freedom). This text was published for the first time in a critical edition by Muhammad Zāhid al-Kawtharī (d. 1952) in the context of a prolonged debate with his senior colleague Mustafā Şabrī (d. 1954), who argued vehemently against compatibilist positions on human freedom and insisted that all such attempts must devolve into either libertarian freedom or determinism. The study will also discuss these sixteen positions in light of Kawtharī and Şabrī's arguments for and against efforts by Islamic theologians and philosophers to offer nuanced compatibilist explanations of how humankind may be free in light of God's omnipotent control of creation. The paper will classify and express these sixteen Islamic theological positions in contemporary terms, providing an intellectual resource for philosophers and theologians interested in comparative philosophical discussions

Abstract

Author(s)

Karim Gabor Kocsenda

Institution

University of Nottingham, UK

Key words

Theological anthropology, free will, human freedom, divine omnipotence

around free will, divine omnipotence, and human agency.

Finding Fitra: Scriptural and Theological Divides on Human Nature

The concept of *fitra* (primordial human nature or natural disposition) plays an important role in Islamic theological anthropology. It is first and foremost a scriptural concept, which is present both within the Qur'an (Q. 30:30) and the Hadīth (especially the hadīth 'every child is born upon the *fitra*...'). The primary sense of *fitra* is that the devotion to God characterising the ethical monotheism of Islam is, in some sense, an inbuilt capacity or inclination of the human being. In this paper, I will argue that the key texts of Islamic scripture relate *fitra* to the purity in belief and practice associated with the Abrahamic legacy and the Prophet Muhammad's renewal therein. Though the impact of early controversies over the divine decree can be felt in some of the related hadīths and theological reception, the prophetic core is free from strong predestinationism. I will propose that there is a significant dividing line in the Islamic theological tradition over whether to link the interpretation of *fitra* to a metaphysical primordial covenant between God and all human beings (usually connected to Q. 7:172) or if emphasis is to instead be placed on human natural capacities within the world. In the former case, the human religious experience is fundamentally one of recall and return, whereas in the latter it is one of instinctual and intellectual realisation.

Abstract

Author(s)

Ramon Harvey

Institution

Cambridge Muslim College, UK

Key words

fitra, Abraham, predestinationism, covenant

Human Uniqueness in the Ecotheological Context: Moltmann and Nasr in Conversation

This paper aims to explore the various dimensions of human uniqueness in the ecotheological context through a conversation between two contemporary theologians, Jürgen Moltmann and Sayyed Hossain Nasr. The question of human uniqueness has become a controversial issue since Darwin's theory of evolution challenged the traditional interpretations of the Abrahamic religious texts. More recently, the traditional understanding of the uniqueness of the human being as the "crown of creation" is being challenged in the context of the ecological crisis, which is seen as a result of problematic relationships between God, the human being, and nature. This paper is based on the assertion that the traditional interpretation of human uniqueness in Abrahamic religions, especially in Christianity, is flawed and has resulted in severe anthropocentrism and distorted relationships between God, human beings, and nature, leading to the ecological crisis. The main body of the paper will consist of three parts: (1) exploring the views and critics of Moltmann and Nasr on the philosophical and theological roots of the ecological crisis, (2) discussing the issue of human uniqueness in the context of the relationship between the human being and God, and (3) examining human uniqueness in the context of the human being's relationship with nature. Through a conversation between Moltmann and Nasr, this paper seeks to develop efficient theological and philosophical interactions between different traditions in the context of the ecological crisis. By exploring the commonalities and disagreements in their formulations on the issue of human uniqueness, this paper aims to contribute to a deeper understanding of the nature of the human being and the relationship between God, the human being, and the natural world. Ultimately, this paper hopes to offer insights into how different religious and philosophical traditions can work together to address the ecological crisis and

promote a more sustainable relationship between humans and the natural world.

Abstract

Author(s) Sevcan Öztürk

Institution | Social Sciences University of Ankara, Turkey

Key words Theological anthropology, ecotheology, comparative theology

Human Nature According to the 'Alawī/Nuṣayrī Doctrinal Literature

'Alawis or Nusayris are a religious within Islam, which has often been branded by medieval Islamic heresiographers (both Sunnīs and Shī'īs as well) as 'extremists, excessive in their doctrines' (ghulāt) and charged with unbelief. Their doctrinal scripts are filled with anthropogenic myths and accounts, unfolded through an endless series of divine creative acts. The outcomes of this eternal process are several Adams, who live in several worlds (between seven and seventy worlds) and are appointed by God as His manifestation (zuhūr) in the same worlds. From an anthropologic viewpoint, the different Adams and the Shī'īs Imams as well are elected creatures, endowed with special faculties like gnosis, prescience, and impeccability. These details seem to corroborate an exclusive status granted to the human being, who is the sole to have language, cognition and an immaterial soul. The same concepts are shared with the rest of the Twelver and heterodox Shī'īs as well, which consider the pre-existence of different Adams by carrying out a metaphorical interpretation (ta wīl) of the Qur'ān. I explain these concepts through the survey of some excerpts from two medieval 'Alawī/Nuṣayrī manuscripts. These are the Book of the Fundaments (Kitāb al-Usūs) and the Book of the Beginning and the Reiteration (Kitāb al-Bad' wa-l-'I'āda). 'Alawī/Nuṣayrī conceptions of theological anthropology will be compared with the hominids /Homo Sapiens categories that are found in Darwin's theory of evolution.

Abstract

Author(s)

Annunziata Russo

Institution(s)

Independent Scholar, Italy

Keywords

Islamic anthropology, language and cognition, human evolution

Tracing the Adamic Link through an Islamic Jurisprudential (fiqh) Matrix on Human Uniqueness and Nature

The notion of Adamic exclusivism proposes that Adam and his descendants interbred with other hominins, resulting in offspring belonging to the human race. Although this perspective has implications for the origins of humanity, the jurisprudential (fiqh) dimensions of human uniqueness, which identify membership in the human race, have been largely overlooked.

The paper proposes that the theological starting point for defining human belonging and uniqueness is the verse, "O men, fear your Lord who created you from a single soul, and from it created its mate, and spread many men and women from the two..." (Q. 4:1). This verse will be examined through a jurisprudential lens to investigate the concept of human uniqueness within the four Sunnī schools of jurisprudence.

The central point of inquiry concerns the unique 'moral status' of human beings, which distinguishes Adam and his progeny from non-human organisms. This moral status, or full moral status (FMS), is grounded in the special honour and unique status conferred by theological and Islamic jurisprudential sources. FMS will be examined from a jurisprudential perspective across various stages of human development, from the zygote and embryo to a fully realized human person possessing FMS.

The analysis will uncover two complementary paths to FMS within the Islamic jurisprudential tradition: (1) membership in the human species, as defined by biology and human form (*takhlīq*), which distinguishes human organisms from non-human organisms; and (2) the possession of a singular capacity that differentiates an embryo (human organism) from a fully developed human (human person) – the human soul. This capacity of the soul, in conjunction with the human form or the embryo's potential for transformation into a child, as the phenotypical expression of the genotype, provides the distinct ontological nature of a human person with FMS.

The paper will then examine the applicability of these paths to other hominins and identify potential points of convergence between the Adamic link and the ongoing biological evolutionary chain, in view of the limitations prescribed within the acceptable theological positions of the verse (Q. 4:1).

Author(s) Rafaqat Rashid

Institution Al Balagh Academy, UK

Key words Adamic link, Human uniqueness, Human moral status, Islamic jurisprudence

Abstract

Adamic Exceptionalism Rejuvenated? Islamic Theological and Legal Perspectives on Interspecies Mating between Humans and the *Jinn*

Can Evolutionary Biology and Islamic Theology intersect on the question of whether Adamic and non-Adamic family lines interbred and had offspring? If so, what epistemic grounds can be invoked to draw such a nexus? Among the various scholarly perspectives available, the theory of Adamic Exceptionalism (AE) offers its fair share of attractions as an intermediate and compatibilist position. Despite its many strengths, one major limitation found in the theory is the paucity of traditional Islamic resources that directly entertain the theoretical or historical possibility of such interspecies breeding occurring in any point of history. This work attempts to support this position by identifying a relevant case of mixed breeding discussed by medieval Muslim scholars, namely the potentiality of mating between humans and the *jinn*.

related yet distinct theoretical questions. Firstly, through the employment of principles informed by theology, they proffered a series of scriptural and rational proofs in order to establish whether it is logically possible for the two species to interbreed. If this question was answered affirmatively, then the investigation turned to the practical dimension by determining whether such interspecies relations are recognized in Islamic law. Most interestingly, upon evaluating the range of scholarly responses on this matter, one can find a number of jurists and theologians who affirmed that such interspecies breeding is logically possible. To substantiate this position, Muslim scholars provided three key pieces of evidence:

Muslim theologians and jurists addressed this proposition by exploring two

1. Textual indicators (*adillah naqliyyah*) from Islamic primary sources, namely the Qur'ān and Sunna, 2. extra-textual indicators (*adillah 'aqliyyah*) informed by reason and metaphysics, and 3. historical reports (*akhbār*) from individuals affirming the occurrence of such events.

The main theoretical observation of this paper is the following: if Muslim theologians could accept cases of mixed breeding with metaphysical beings like the *jinn*, then it can *a fortiori* be applied and considered in the case of other humanoid-like beings. Even more importantly, since this case study of interspecies breeding validates the theoretical postulates of AE, then it supports the position that the uniqueness of humankind largely rests in the miraculous creation of Adam and Eve, as there is the logical possibility that there was mixed breeding between Adamic and non-Adamic lineages in later historical periods.

Author(s) Massoud Vahedi

Institution Independent Researcher, Canada

Key words | khabar, nagl, 'agl, Adamic Exceptionalism (AE), jinn

Abstract